

LOUISIANA CYBERSECURITY COMMISSION



20 March 2018
Meeting Minutes

Louisiana Cyber Security Commission
Meeting Minutes March 20, 2018

- Commissioners in attendance
 - Chair: Craig Spohn
 - Co-Chair: MG Glenn Curtis
 - Commissioners
 - Kevin Reeves – Louisiana State Police
 - Casey Tingle (In Proxy for Dir. James Waskom) - GOSHEP
 - Richard “Dickie” Howze – Division of Administration
 - Mark Northrop – CLECO
 - Edward Flynn – Louisiana Chemical Association
 - William Bradley – CenturyLink
 - Ramesh Kolluru – University of Louisiana Lafayette (ULL)
 - Jeffrey Moulton – Louisiana State University (LSU)
 - Fran Gladden – COX
 - Sonya Wiley – Rapides Parish EOC
 - Brahmananda Yenumula Reddy, Ph.D. – Grambling State University (GSU)
 - Dr. Leslie Guice – Louisiana Tech University (LA Tech)
 - Kyle Ardoin – Office of Secretary of State
 - Ex-Officio members
 - Thomas Travis – Louisiana Department of Insurance
 - Drew Watts – FBI
 - Corey Harris – FBI
 - Phillip Constantin – DHS
 - Jeff McKee – DHS
 - Brant Mitchell – SDMI
 - CDR Scott Benson – USCG
 - Curtis McGiffin – Louisiana Tech Research Institute
 - Dr. Michael Dunaway – LABEOC
 - Staff
 - Alberto Depuy – Office of Attorney General
 - MAJ Sarah Anderson – LANG JAG
 - LTC Henry Capello – Cyberspace Planner/SME
 - MAJ Michael Bendich – Cyberspace Planner/SME
 - Joshua Fisher – Admin Support – Cyber Innovation Center
 - COL Kenneth Donnelly – LANG

NOTES:

1430 – Meeting Begins

Craig Spohn – Opening Remarks

- COL Ken Donnelly – Opening Remarks (Roll Call – Complete, have a quorum of all Committee Members we have one proxy, Casey Tingle for Director Waskom (GOHSEP).
- Craig Spohn (Chair) – Calls meeting to order, Hands back to COL Donnelly for general House Keeping and to review the slide handouts to include the agenda, and the way ahead.

- COL Donnelly reviews the Agenda, PowerPoint, Back-up Slides in the handout that all Committee Members and Ex-Officio Members have in their possession.
 - Addresses the Open Meeting Law and the Public Record Law (COL Donnelly introduces AG office representative, (Kyle Ardoin) and MAJ Sarah Anderson (LANG) for any legal advice/guidance/questions referring to either of the above (Open Meeting Law or Public Record Law).
 - The way the Governance of the Commission will work is based on “Robert’s Rules”. Robert’s Rules can be found in the back of the slide handout packet which was provided to Commissioners and Ex-Officio Members.
 - Public record law requires meetings open to public.
 - All records of meetings will be made available to the public.
 - All meetings will be posted to the Governors Public meeting website and all agendas will be approved by the Chair and posted to the public meeting website prior to the meeting.
 - If the Commissioners would like to add an item to an upcoming agenda, Commissioners will send that particular item to the Chair and by Commissioner Consensus, that particular agenda item will be added to the next meeting agenda
 - If the Public body wishes to take on anything additional than what is presented on a specific day’s agenda, we would have to do that by unanimous decision by the commissioners – ex-officio members do not have a voting right.
 - Specifically, for a quorum there are 15 Commissioners - if all Commissioners are present, a majority would be 8. Conditions where that may change – if there is a vacant position by one of the commissioners, that position would not be counted in the majority. If there is a proxy serving for a commissioner, that proxy would be included in the vote for the majority.
 - Presented the public record law and mentioned that all meeting minutes are public record and will be recorded.
 - LANG is the executive body and will be the keeper of the minutes and make the meeting minutes available.
 - COL Ken Donnelly and MAJ Mike Bendich are the Points of Contact for minutes and LANG.
 - Charter explanation – The Charter lays out the duties and responsibilities of the Commission and is in conjunction with the executive order that was written by the Governor. It spells out the goals of the Commission and the Mission of the Commission. The Charter is provided to all in the back-up slides handout.
- COL Donnelly addresses the Chairman to request to make a motion to accept the Charter and have it signed today.
 - Each commissioner has read the charter.
 - Kyle Ardoin motions to approve charter.
 - Dr. Guice seconds.
 - Charter is unanimously approved with zero “no” votes
 - Discussion: Sonya Wiley – Under “purpose” we should find key stake holders and subject matter experts. The charter identifies private industry, academia and law enforcement – should we say public safety, emergency management? To include all emergency response?

- Craig Spohn responds that Ex-Officio members will cover the emergency response/management piece.
- Craig Spohn stresses that committees will be working groups. Contribute all we have available to offer to the committees.
 - MG Curtis (Co-Chair) Agrees on the importance of the committees.
 - Discussion: Working groups and the Governor's office will have to work together to be successful.
- 2:37pm Governor's Remarks
 - Stresses the Importance of this Commission for Louisiana
 - Kept Task Force small so work can actually be done
 - Protect Government, bus, if citizens and hopefully mil
 - We may land a Cyber BN here in LA
 - Establish LA as a national leader in Cyber Security
 - Commission needs to work together and establish committees to accomplish 9 goals
 - 9 goals of the Commission
 - Asked to create something that doesn't exist. Doing something for the first time. Expertise and visionary that will get us there
 - Important to get kids interested in Cyber
 - I-20 Corridor is focused on Cyber currently
 - Get out of comfort zones – suggest new and bold thing in the cyber field
 - Discusses Election System threats – Looking at Kyle Ardoin
 - If need resources, ask the Governor's Office
 - Gov hands back off to Craig Spohn
- Craig Spohn
 - Committees will be working groups consisting of members with relevant stake and subject matter knowledge.
- MG Curtis - Committee chairs should recruit SMEs to respective committees from federal, state, and local levels.
 - Working Groups within the Committees will be critical to success.
 - If you chair a committee, recruit SMEs in the industry not on the Commission.
 - If you have federal, state or local SMEs, utilize those assets.
 - Hands back to Craig Spohn.
- Craig Spohn – LA is in top 5 states for cyber according to Louisiana Circuit of State Government.
 - Hopeful that with the commission in place, LA will continue to remain at the top in the nation.
 - Silicon Valley for Cyber in LA, as the GOV said is possible.
 - Hands back over to COL Donnelly.
- COL Donnelly leads committee development session
 - Oath of Office can be picked up. Sarah Anderson can notarize any oath of office today.
 - Process Development slides will be brought up for review.
 - Cyber Readiness and Resiliency slide.

- National Governors association described what a governance body should look like.
- Addresses Pell study on cyber resiliency and readiness.
 - What makes cyber resiliency and cyber readiness – review on slide.
 - The finding slide summarizes what other states have done so far and what is still missing.
 - Governor's 9 goals were fit into the core components of the cyber resiliency.
 - Areas of focus slide
 - Focus of committees and committee leads.
 - LTC Capello will assist.
 - Bendich and Durel hand out slides to facilitate discussion on committee leads and co-leads.
 - Hands back over to Craig Spohn to begin brainstorming on the committee development and committee chairs based off of the Governor's 9 goals.
- Craig Spohn
 - Initial Thoughts are that goals 3 and 5 somewhat redundant.
 - 6 and 7 belong together possibly.
 - Opens it up to the commissioners.
 - Ramesh Kolluru – Agrees with Craig on 6 and 7 belonging together.
 - Craig – Workforce development and education tied to economic development component. Sees natural combination there. Not limited to the people in the room for committees - Open to everyone.
 - Edward Flynn – Where did the committee names come from?
 - COL Donnelly – The committee names were developed from the Governor's 9 goals for the commission. They are tied into the Governors 9.
 - Do we want to consider elections security as a separate committee?
- Kyle Ardoin – Elections are unique and should have their own committee.
 - Social media, election – there is a very broad range being covered here.
 - MG Curtis – uses FL election as example of vulnerability.
- Jeffrey Moulton – We need to better define each committee so we know what they cover before we vote to approve. Can't agree or disagree unless he knows what each committee is. ESF 17, is an example of knowing what it is.
 - LTC Capello – We need to identify/define threats and vulnerabilities and controls. He agrees with Moulton. Explains to Moulton what cyber security is to him.
 - Jeffrey Moulton – Volunteers to chair Maritime Cyber Security Committee as the 11th Committee. Mississippi River is huge part of LA, Mentions Coast Guard, ESF 17 – Is maritime a part of ESF 17?
 - Dr. Guice – Maritime is a critical infrastructure protection.
 - LTC Capello – Concur with Moulton – Understand what risk is. Understanding what are the risks and what are the vulnerabilities.
 - Dr. Guice asks about critical infrastructure protection where those would be covered.
 - Donnelly – critical infrastructure is separated.

- Capello – 16 – 17 critical infrastructure sectors do we have a committee for each or do we lump them? He thinks maritime is a big one.
- Craig Spohn – If we identify Maritime and Elections as unique committees, the number of committees could become too many. Consider consolidating committees and include representatives from each interest group. Do we group all of these into CIKR and have each as a subcommittee under that? Chemical industry, guard ex to test infrastructure. How detailed would each be if we id each as a separate committee? Do get oil and gas, pipeline chemical, maritime to make CIKR committee?
 - Jeffrey Moulton – We’ve honed in on elections. Maybe big 6? Maritime part of ESF 17? He doesn’t know about banking, but knows about the river.
- Mark Northrup – The key is to identify assets which to protect i.e. Maritime and elections
 - Craig Spohn – Need discussion on identifying assets.
 - Mark Northrop – Agree, identified classified assets and assets critical to this piece.
 - Asset that is maritime.
 - Here are assets in state, then rank those high risk.
 - Then committees decide to merge them accordingly.
 - Without knowing assets, we will never get out of start.
 - Craig Spohn – Discussion on identifying assets. Bringing the discussion back to Governors 9 focus areas.
 - Build matrix.
 - Develop a consensus around what specific things are to building committees.
 - Mark Northrup – Rank the assets based on available information. Based on threats and what they are.
 - LTC Capello – Uses the NIS Cyber Security Framework as an example.
 - Identify and prioritize risks.
 - Craig Spohn – Do we pursue that line of organization as a vote?
 - Kyle Ardoin – Build a model around banking, CKIR – but Elections are different than banking and other pieces. Critical part of democracy. Most don’t understand how elections work. Urge to keep elections as separate committee
 - Craig Spohn – Agrees with Ardoin. Integrity to election are important. Elections stand out. Unique carve out.
 - Ramesh Kolluru – Agree, elections remain separate. Also agrees with Mark Northrop on identifying assets and inventory assets.
 - MG Curtis – Mark, please explain more about identifying assets (refineries, utilities, banking).
 - Mark Northrop – Start with identifying the industries (50K view). Assets and assets that are considered a risk. If you start high and then break down to sub-committees, that would be the best approach. Possibly review each asset every 6 months to ensure assets are still viable.
 - MG Curtis – ID committees, oversight committees, etc.

Louisiana Cyber Security Commission
Meeting Minutes March 20, 2018

- Mark Northrup – High tech and digital forensics subcommittee can mean a lot to a lot of different people. Maybe take a Task Force of individuals to identify assets. Risk identification of assets. Surely there will be many sub-committees.
- Spohn - Subdivision of multi assets would produce a file order of the prioritization of assets. Establishing a critical infrastructure and key resources committee and rank order of the assets? Maritime is an element of many key resources in the state. More than river traffic. Let's create committees – power grid, transportation grid, on top of rail road all mechanisms have an impact based on those issues. This would be one title, then break down to sub-committees.
- Mark Northrup – Agree with critical infrastructure assets. ID assets, Ranking, prioritization. Utilize info sharing between law enforcement, FBI to use for basis of next meeting.
- GOHSEP – use info that is already there. Use some of the thought and prioritization that has already gone on to identify areas of focus that have come from that to figure out the best way to move forward.
- MG Curtis – start with charter and executive order. We have to get this right. We are struggling to get the committees, which may be a good thing. Propose not only looking at assets, but using Governor's 9 priorities are about an 80% solution. We can address those to start. Take a step back to take 9 priorities get a Task Force with goals. Take 30-45 days to have people look at committee build outs - What they should look like and be named.
- Mark Northrup – Lets move forward - Commissioners want to move forward
- MG Curtis – We have to identify the mission to move forward. Have to define mission correctly and understand it. What action items the committees have. Most products in the handout are the same 5 – 6 people trying to get things started.
 - Edward Flynn – Mission statement in slide deck. Good job to the team that built the initial product. Started with blank slides to get us started.
- Kyle Ardoin – committee 3 and 5 are almost identical. Should we combine the two?
 - LTC Capello – some info used from other states, there may be some redundancies. I agree, but commission has to agree.
 - Discussion: On slide – 3. Information Sharing and Integration Center Development, 5. Information Sharing Subcommittee.
 - Mark Northrup – Assets of the State, people of the State, security of the State. Information sharing and risk mitigation revolve around these three.
 - Kyle Ardoin – Everything we've discussed pretty much falls under these three things: Education, workforce development, governance. Education of election security is around continuity of government.
- Jeffrey Moulton – 40% of the original committees are good, 60% need more discussion. High tech needs more refining, everything is high tech.
 - Jeffrey Moulton volunteers to lead Emergency Preparedness (ESF 17) committee. High Tech needs to be broken down.
- MG Curtis – begin checking down the list of committees.
 - Ardoin – clarify what no. 1 means.
 - Ramesh Kolluru – map to 3 areas, people, institutions and development.

Louisiana Cyber Security Commission
Meeting Minutes March 20, 2018

- Mark Northrop – Suggest a mapping exercise to expose things we may not have thought about.
- MG Curtis – Is that a “yes”?
 - To number 1? Yes
- MG Curtis – Ok, we’re making progress, yes to # 1.
- MG Curtis - Emergency Preparedness Committee. That’s pretty specific.
 - COL Donnelly – thumbs up.
 - # 2 stays as is.
- MG Curtis – Are we in agreement that we’re going to combine #'s 3 and 5?
 - Discussion: Yes from several members.
 - MG Curtis – OK we’re good there.
- MG Curtis – Risk Mitigation, is that one that needs more definition?
 - Discussion: I think so because risk mitigation covers all topics. Risk mitigation is more what the entire commission is about rather than a specific committee. Maybe a cyber resilience committee to look at redundancies, vulnerabilities.
- MG Curtis – Do we want to keep 6 and 7 separate? Is number 6, Workforce Development and Education a good committee?
 - Discussion – Maybe insert the word “awareness”
 - “Awareness” or “outreach”
 - Ramesh Kolluru – outreach is a good word there.
 - MG Curtis - Change 6 to Workforce Development, Education, and Public Outreach.
- MG Curtis - Economic Development Committee stays.
- MG Curtis – I know we need to change some wording in no.8.
 - Matthew Ramey (FBI) – Prosecution is an issue. Attorneys are hesitant to charge intrusion into systems. That feeds into legislation. Also forensics could be rolled under law enforcement. Reference Governor’s goal no.7 digital forensics and cyber investigative capability. In summary, I’m proposing Law Enforcement, Prosecution, Legislation, and possibly Forensics as a subcommittee.
 - MG Curtis – Suggest that legislation stay separate. Need to pay particular attention, especially with State law and to influence municipalities. May not be able to affect fed law
 - Discussion among members.
 - MG Curtis – The legislative committee may have little to do in the beginning, but as the committees begin working they may deem that they need some legislation or funding.
 - Craig Spohn – Change wording on no.8 to read “ Law Enforcement and Prosecution” and leave # 9 to say “Legislation and Funding” digital forensics will be part of law enforcement.
 - Matthew Rainey (FBI) – Sometimes even as federal agents we work with the District Attorney’s office to prosecute cases. So if we could get the state to tighten its cyber security laws - that would be beneficial.
 - MG Curtis – Agree. Both committees will work hand in hand to affect law enforcement and prosecution. The legislation committee will also serve to

guide legislation for the private sector when it comes to cyber security. Could also affect the college systems. We also need to be smart when going after funds.

- MG Curtis – Does “Law Enforcement, Prosecution, and Digital Forensics” cover it?
 - Matthew (FBI) – yes
- Craig Spohn – Consider different title authorities that you work under and how they limit what you can do. Title 10, 32, and 18. The legislative committee would do the same thing with respect to the information sharing committee. The limitations are constitutional but serve as an impediment to our effectiveness. If you could inform each other without regard to title authority, that would be a big undertaking.
- Matthew – sometimes classification of data might become an issue, but I agree, we have to be able to share information across various committees.
- MG Curtis – Are we good with these 2 committees?
- Discussion: Shouldn’t the legislative committee serve the entire commission?
- MG Curtis – Yes. One of the things the Governor asked us to do was to inform him what laws need to be changed, killed, developed, etc. as it pertains to cyber security. Each committee will discover needs that require legislation, which will be taken up by the legislative committee. It’s a separate committee to prevent the other committees from too much focus on legislation.
- Conclusion – no.8 Law Enforcement, Prosecution, and Digital Forensics, no. 9 Legislation and Funding
 - Election Security will be separate committee
- MG Curtis for discussion – Maritime cyber security as separate committee?
 - LTC Capello – separate.
 - Casey Tingle – Keep under ESF 17 for now.
 - Jeffrey Moulton – Can live with that, but ESF 17 is an incident response plan, Maritime is an ongoing issue.
 - Jeff McKee (DHS) – Focus around sectors “Big 6”. Maritime should fall under one of these. The commission should be focused on reducing risk. DHS has prioritized a number of resources to elections, so keeping that committee is good.
 - Ramesh Kolluru – We may accomplish risk mitigation by expanding # 1 to Cyber Risks, Assets, and Capabilities Working Group.
 - MG Curtis – Do we leave Maritime in Emergency Preparedness for now until we do further staff analysis? Yes, ok.
- MG Curtis – Holding off on resiliency group for now.
- MG Curtis – Let’s get the names right. I’m about to make a motion.
 - 1. Cyber Risks, Assets, and Capabilities Assessment Working Group
 - 2. Emergency Preparedness Subcommittee (ESF 17)
 - 3. Information Sharing and Integration Center Development Subcommittee and it is to be combined with 5. Information Sharing
 - 6. Workforce Development, Education, and Public Outreach

Louisiana Cyber Security Commission
Meeting Minutes March 20, 2018

- 7. Economic Development
 - 8. Law Enforcement, Prosecution, and Digital Forensics
 - 9. Legislation and Funding
 - 10. Election Security
- MG Curtis – Did I miss anything?
- MG Curtis – Motion to establish these committees as stated above.
 - Motion passes with zero “no” votes.
- MG Curtis – Starts discussion on who will lead each committee.

- The following committees are settled upon after discussion
 - Cyber Risks, Assets and Capabilities Assessment
 - Chair: Mark Northrop
 - Co-Chair: Ramesh Kolluru
 - Emergency Preparedness (ESF 17)
 - Chair: Jeffrey Moulton
 - Co-Chair: Edward Flynn
 - Co-Chair: Casey Tingle
 - Information Sharing and Integration
 - Chair: Ramesh Kolluru
 - Co-Chair: Dr. Reddy
 - Co-Chair: Kevin Reeves LSP
 - Workforce Development, Education, and Public Outreach
 - Chair: Dr. Guice
 - Co-Chair: Dr. Reddy
 - Economic Development
 - Chair: Dr. Dunaway
 - Law Enforcement, Prosecution, and Digital Forensics
 - Chair: Kevin Reeves (LSP)
 - Co-Chair: Matthew Rainey (FBI)
 - Legislation and Funding
 - Chair: MG Curtis
 - Co-Chair: Craig Spohn
 - Election Security
 - Chair: Kyle Ardoin

- COL Donnelly – Offer a chance for the public or media to comment if present.
 - No public comments
 - No media
- COL Donnelly – Offers chance for anyone present to address the commission.
 - No comments
- COL Donnelly – Offers chance for closing comments from ex-officio members.
 - No comments
- COL Donnelly – Offers chance for any closing comments from commissioners
 - Ms. Wiley – Will the primary objectives be defined in the next meeting.
 - COL Donnelly – Objectives to be included in committee reports.

Louisiana Cyber Security Commission
Meeting Minutes March 20, 2018

- Chairman – The next meeting will occur in approximately 30-45 days.
 - COL Donnelly will send a range of dates and we'll settle on the best time
- MG Curtis – Way ahead - Committee chairs should return with an understanding of the scope of work ahead of them “define the mission”.
 - Recruit SMEs for your committee.
 - Scope/Mission Statements will be agreed upon next meeting.
- Craig Spohn – Closing remarks: Thank you to COL Donnelly and team for putting this meeting together.
- 4:37pm
 - Commissioner motions to adjourn
 - Motion is passed and meeting is adjourned

Due Out #1: LANG will determine and notify members the date and time of the next meeting.

Due Out #2: Members will determine the scope of their individual committees/subcommittees.

Mike Bendich